

TO: Education, Personnel, and Student Life Committee Megan Cluver, Chair Karen Luneau, Vice Chair Janette Bombardier Shirley Jefferson Jim Masland Mary Moran Perry Ragouzis

Yezon

- **FROM:** Yasmine Ziesler, Chief Academic Officer
- **RE:** EPSL Meeting on May 22, 2023
- **DATE:** May 16, 2023

The EPSL Committee of the Board of Trustees is scheduled to meet on Monday, May 22nd from 1:00 to 2:30pm by Zoom.

The first major focus topic for the meeting will be a focus on transformation updates for Vermont State University. These include status updates on student and faculty governance as requested by the committee as follow up from the March 13, 2023 meeting. Vermont State University Interim President Mike Smith will also be sharing details of the University's initial strategic plan in preparation for full Board review at the June 12, 2023 meeting. The plan is included in the meeting materials. For your reference, please also see <u>the Board's strategic priorities as adopted in 2020</u>.

The second major focus topic will be an update on progress to integrate graduation standards established by the Board via Policy 106 within the new system-wide general education framework and related efforts to complete a general education program design for Vermont State University. Included in the meeting materials is a memo that summarizes the status of this work and recommendations on next steps from the Chief Academic Officers' Group.

Action items for this meeting are the approval of revisions to VSC Policy 108 and VSC Policy 111. As discussed at the March 13, 2023 committee meeting, these revisions are a result of various transformation efforts, including in particular work by the VSC registrars' team. The changes bring practices around transfer credit into stronger alignment between CCV and Vermont State University and establish more clarity about the shared courses and academic transcript for all VSC students.

I can be reached directly at (802) 224-3025 if you have any questions.

Thank you.

WWW.VSC.EDU INFO@VSC.EDU Cc: VSC Board of Trustees Council of Presidents Chief Academic Officers Student Affairs Council HR Council

Vermont State Colleges Board of Trustees Education, Personnel, and Student Life Committee

May 22, 2023

AGENDA

- 1. Call to order
- 2. Comments from the public
- 3. Approval of March 13, 2023 meeting minutes
- 4. Vermont State University transformation progress updates
 - a. Student Association
 - b. Faculty Governance
 - c. Vermont State University Strategic Plan
- 5. Approval of revisions to VSC Policies 108 and 111
- 6. General education status update and recommendations
- 7. Other business

MATERIALS

- 1. March 13, 2023 Minutes
- 2. Vermont State University Strategic Plan
- 3. VSC Policy 108 Revisions
- 4. VSC Policy 111 Revisions
- 5. General Education Status Update Memo

ITEM 1:

March 13, 2023 Minutes

Minutes of the VSCS Board of Trustees' Education, Personnel, and Student Life Committee meeting held Monday March 13, 2023 at 1:00 p.m. via Zoom - UNAPPROVED

Note: These are unapproved minutes, subject to amendment and/or approval at the subsequent meeting.

The VSCS Board of Trustees Education, Personnel, and Student Life Committee met on Monday, March 13, 2023 via Zoom.

Committee Members present: Megan Cluver (Chair), David Durfee, Shirley Jefferson, Karen Luneau (1:11 p.m.), Mary Moran (1:20 p.m.), Perry Ragouzis

Absent:	Janette Bombardier
Other Trustees present:	Lynn Dickinson, Jim Masland
Presidents:	Parwinder Grewal, Joyce Judy
Chancellor's Office Staff:	Donny Bazluke, Network/Security Analyst Kellie Campbell, Chief Information Officer Wilson Garland, Director of Transformation Kathryn Levasseur, Governmental & External Affairs Pat Moulton, Executive Director, Workforce Development Jen Porrier, Administrative Director Kathryn Santiago, Associate General Counsel Sharron Scott, Chief Financial and Operating Officer Patty Turley, General Counsel Meg Walz, Director, Project Management Sophie Zdatny, Chancellor Yasmine Ziesler, Chief Academic Officer
From the Colleges:	Nolan Atkins, Provost, Northern Vermont University and Vermont State University Miranda Axworthy, Reference & Instruction Librarian, Castleton University Kelley Beckwith, Vice President of Student Success, Vermont State University Elizabeth Bergman, Interlibrary Loan Specialist, Northern Vermont University Pat Brougham, Faculty, Castleton University Leigh-Ann Brown, Faculty, Castleton University Sarah Chambers, Director of Learning Technologies, Castleton University Rich Clark, Faculty, Castleton University

Brad Coupe, Faculty, Castleton University Ana Gaillat, Dean of Academic Affairs, Vermont Technical College Charlotte Gerstein, Reference & Instruction Librarian, Castleton University Kim Hannon-Brobst, Reference Librarian, Vermont Technical College Hilary Linehan, Director of Athletics & Recreation, Vermont **Technical College** Amy Bremel, Coordinator of Advocacy, Activism, & Non-Violence Education, Castleton University David Mook, Faculty, Castleton University Alejandra Nann, Librarian, Northern Vermont University Billie Neathawk, Unit Chair, Staff Federation, Castleton University Jean-Paul Orgeron, Research Librarian, Northern Vermont University Maurice Ouimet, Vice President of Admissions, Castleton University Katherine Penberthy, CCV Faculty Liaison to EPSL Committee Lisa Pleban, Faculty, Castleton University Monique Prive, Acquisitions Coordinator, Northern Vermont University Denise Rhodes, Consultant, Finance & Registration Services, **Castleton University** Angela Sillars, Faculty, Castleton University Anne Slonaker, Faculty, Castleton University Debby Stewart, Dean of Academic Affairs, Community College of Vermont Stephanie Traverse, Access Services Librarian, Castleton University Sarah Truckle, Vice President of Business Operations, Vermont State University Beth Walsh, President, VSCUP, Northern Vermont University Heather Weinstein, Dean of Strategic Initiatives and Student Affairs, Community College of Vermont Erin Wetherell, CCV Staff Liaison to EPSL Committee

From the Public:

Adam Grinold, Executive Director, Brattleboro Development Credit Corporation

1. Call to Order

Chair Cluver called the meeting to order at 1:02 p.m. Chair Cluver welcomed the staff liaisons from CCV and mentioned there is still some work remaining to establish liaisons for the future VTSU but that representative leaders from the future VTSU are welcome to attend and contribute.

2. Approval of January 9, 2023 Meeting Minutes

<u>Trustee Jefferson moved and Trustee Ragouzis seconded the motion to approve the</u> January 9, 2023 meeting minutes. The motion was approved unanimously.

3. Approval of Revised Honorary Degree Resolution

Chair Cluver presented the revised Honorary Degree Resolution, stating that the updates were requested by the family of the honoree to correct and clarify some of the original details.

<u>Trustee Ragouzis moved and Trustee Jefferson seconded the motion to recommend to the</u> <u>Board the approval of Resolution 2022-018, Northern Vermont University Conferral of</u> <u>Honorary Degree. The motion was approved unanimously.</u>

4. <u>Workforce Development Update</u>

Chair Cluver explained that workforce development is a key priority for EPSL. Chair Cluver then introduced Adam Grinold, in his professional role as Executive Director of the Brattleboro Development Credit Corporation and Chair of the Vermont State Workforce Development Board. Mr. Grinold gave an overview of the workforce development system in Vermont, with some important background of the system. He then went on to discuss the future of jobs and how Vermont and the workforce must upskill to meet the projected needs.

Pat Moulton, Executive Director of Workforce Development, reiterated Mr. Grinold's assertion on the importance of STEM education and strong foundational math and English skills for the upcoming work force. With many job openings, employers are seeking to upskill their current employees. Apprenticeship solutions have also become popular for job seekers. Ms. Moulton reported on her recent projects, contracts and contacts.

- 5. Academic Transformation Updates
- a. NECHE Progress Report

Chief Academic Officer Yasmine Ziesler shared that the second of three progress reports is due to NECHE, the regional accreditor, on March 24th. For each report, NECHE asks for updates on certain items. For this report the focus is on two items: the budget and enrollment projections and the elimination of structural deficit, and the development of a hybrid operational model for Vermont State University. With regards to the first item, in this report, based on the first-pass budget discussed last month at the Finance and Facilities committee meeting, the five-year projection identifies a need to achieve an additional \$2.7M in structural savings through a combination of increased revenues and expense reductions to fully eliminate the structural

deficit. As for the development of VTSU, there is much progress to report, including the work of faculty on developing Face to Face Plus courses and student success teams such as advising and career development. The report is also candid about the significant discussion and concerns raised in response to the digital libraries announcement and is clear that there is a refined plan now being considered by our many stakeholders.

b. Faculty Governance

Dr. Ziesler then provided an update on the significant work being done by the faculty leaders and faculty assemblies to review governance models. There is a draft proposal of the governance model for review that will be voted on before the end of the academic year. Chair Cluver requested a further update at the next EPSL meeting.

c. Student Association

Trustee Ragouzis provided an update on the student governance models being considered for VTSU. He shared that there are priorities set by the students including associating a microcredential with student leadership services. This might include documentation of the soft skills developed in leadership services in student government. Additionally, there is a hope to create a model across all five campuses to create fluidity between the clubs and organizations to maintain a set of standards for all campuses. Trustee Ragouzis looks forward to having a strong student government with strong leadership potential involved on each campus, knowing this will bolster the transformation process.

d. Proposed Revisions to VSC Academic Policies 108 and 111

Dr. Ziesler provided information about the revisions to Policies 108 and 111, stating that both represent changes that bring practices and transfer credit into stronger alignment between Community College of Vermont and VTSU. These revisions will establish more clarity about the shared courses and academic transcript for all VSC students. These revisions are only informational for the committee currently.

e. Libraries

Chancellor Zdatny took a moment to recognize and acknowledge that the original announcement regarding the libraries did not unfold as intended, but the significance of decisions such as this show the importance of learning from the past as we go forward. This highlighted the value of working with internal communities before final decisions are made. The Chancellor also emphasized the state's mandate – that the VSCS must reduce its structural deficit by \$25 million over five years. Feedback and input has been critical in helping to shape the revised plan for the libraries. Provost Atkins shared a presentation on the refined libraries plan draft which can be found here.

6. <u>Comments from the Public</u>

The committee heard comments from the public for fifteen minutes. All comments were focused on the proposed changes to the libraries at Vermont State University.

7. Executive Session

At 3:08 p.m. Trustee Cluver moved that the Committee enter executive session pursuant to 1 V.S.A. § 313(a)(3) to discuss the appointment and employment of public officers. It was

<u>further moved that the Committee enter executive session, pursuant to 1 V.S.A. §</u> <u>313(a)(1)(D) to discuss grievances, 1 V.S.A. § 313(a)(1)(E) to discuss pending civil litigation, and 1 V.S.A. § 313(a)(1)(F) to consider confidential attorney-client communications, because premature general public knowledge would clearly place the public body involved at a substantial disadvantage. Along with the members of the Board present at the meeting, the Board invited the Chancellor, the Presidents, and the General Counsel to attend the executive session. Trustee Moran seconded the motion and it was approved unanimously.</u>

The committee exited executive session at 4:12 p.m. and took no action.

8. Other Business

Chair Cluver thanked President Grewal, President Judy, Chancellor Zdatny, and their staff for leading the work through this transformation. Chair Cluver went on to thank the faculty for their dedication and hard work on the faculty governance while also serving the students. She continued, thanking the students and Trustee Ragouzis for bringing the student perspective into the conversation, as their voices and ideas are critical to the transformation process.

There was no other business.

Chair Cluver adjourned the meeting at 4:15 p.m.

ITEM 2:

Vermont State University Strategic Plan

Vermont State University Strategic Plan

May, 2023

Strategic Priority #1:			
To be the nation's first statewi improved student achievement	de, hybrid university with expanded acce t at its core.	ess, increased affordability, and	
Objective 1.1 Increase access to high-quality education through flexible in- person, in-person-plus, and onlin delivery modalities.	Objective 1.2 Increase affordability through innovative program structures, operational efficiency, and sustainable growth.	Objective 1.3 Improve student achievement through increased engagement in holistic success programs, services, and supports.	Objective 1.4 Celebrate and promote the achievements and contributions of Vermont State University
 Metrics: A. Percentage of program cours offered in in-person plus and online modalities. B. Number of students by type enrolled in programs by modality. C. Measure academic success across all modalities. 	Metrics: es A. Enrollment and revenue growth rates B. Physical footprint occupancy rate	 Metrics: A. Student retention, completion rates, and graduate outcomes, including credit accumulation rates, internship completion, and other effectiveness measures by student type, cohort, modality, start term, etc. B. Achievement gaps by income, gender, first-generation status, race/ethnicity, age, etc. C. Comprehensive student success satisfaction analysis. 	Metrics: A. Brand Awareness and Opinion Survey (a few years out) B. Admissions survey to test why they didn't choose Vermont State
Strategic Initiatives/Projects			
1.1.1 Develop and expand a new Online program administrat model aligned with the new academic school structure.	c .	 1.3.1 Integrate all student success functional areas under one unit. 1.3.2 Implement the shared advising model to support students across 	1.4.1 Develop a comprehensive communications plan1.4.2 Enhance the brand presence of Vermont State
1.1.2 Launch the new school and academic administration structure and process.	 undergraduate, graduate, and no degree enrollments. 1.2.3 Develop and implement program evaluation criteria to determine 	on- all modalities. 1.3.3 Implement a new career	1.4.3 Showcase student, faculty, and staff creative, professional, and scholarly work

-		1				
1.1.3	Develop faculty governance		strategic investments and align		attainment in collaboration with	1.4.4 Engage alumni as ambassadors
	that includes an efficient		enrollment priorities.		advising and the General	and as mentors for students
	curriculum approval process.	1.2.4	Develop and implement		Education program.	1.4.5 Strengthen the community
1.1.4	Develop and launch faculty		scholarship criteria that serve	1.3.4	Establish and monitor a	through common events and
	professional development		student affordability goals,		comprehensive set of benchmarks	experiences and engagements
	(Phase 1 includes Modalities,		promote retention, and create		and yearly goals for key Student	1.4.6 Design and deliver cultural and arts programs and events across all
	DEI outcomes in Gen Ed		strong partnerships and outcomes.	4.9.5	Success measures.	instructional locations and for our
	prioritizing CNX1, and	1.2.5	Evaluate opportunities to expand	1.3.5	Establish and monitor a	community
115	Embedding Micro-credentials).		student employment to maximize		comprehensive set of benchmarks and yearly goals for the four	community
1.1.5	Launch and complete Phase 2 and 3 of the In-Person Plus		operational efficiencies and		athletic programs.	
	(including 1:1 Device) pilot.		promote student professional	1.3.6	Design and pilot a dashboard to	
1.1.6	Establish consistent baseline		development.		measure progress toward student	
1.1.0	expectations for technology	1.2.6	Evaluate student services expenses		success goals: student's sense of	
	usage (Canvas, gradebook,		and identify opportunities for		belonging and identity, academic	
	scheduling, etc.).		efficiency and streamlining.		purpose, self-efficacy, access and	
		1.2.7	Evaluate and develop a per		equity, career readiness, and post-	
			student recruitment cost and	1.3.7	graduation success.	
			identify and operationalize	1.5.7	Develop and implement a master plan for student surveys.	
			mechanisms to optimize	1.3.8	Develop and implement a	
			recruitment costs.	2.0.0	predictive model for student	
		1.2.8	Develop and implement		success.	
			recruitment strategies that			
			diversify our student body in			
			intentional and sustainable ways,			
			promoting diversity, equity, and			
		120	inclusion.			
		1.2.9	Develop an instructional cost			
			model and use this model to assess			
			contribution margins and drive			
		4 3 4 9	decision-making.			
		1.2.10	Develop a comprehensive financial			
			analytics and planning team with			
			robust quarterly financial			
			monitoring.			
		1.2.11	Develop financial governance			
l			structures to create efficient			
			processes for approving			

 expenditures, establishing new programs and lines of business, and maintaining appropriate internal controls. 2.12 Establish position management governance structure to control and allow for controls and flexibility with vacancies, turnover, and other staffing changes to achieve optimal administrative structures. 2.13 Right size physical assets and capital investments based on the 		
	 programs and lines of business, and maintaining appropriate internal controls. .12 Establish position management governance structure to control and allow for controls and flexibility with vacancies, turnover, and other staffing changes to achieve optimal administrative structures. .13 Right size physical assets and capital investments based on the current and anticipated future size 	 programs and lines of business, and maintaining appropriate internal controls. .12 Establish position management governance structure to control and allow for controls and flexibility with vacancies, turnover, and other staffing changes to achieve optimal administrative structures. .13 Right size physical assets and capital investments based on the current and anticipated future size

Strategic Priority #2:		
Position the university as a premier career read	dy university.	
Objective 2.1 Embed industry-recognized micro-credentials in every degree path.	Objective 2.2 Embed real-world applied learning opportunities in every degree path.	Objective 2.3 Develop need-inspired and forward-thinking degree and certificate programs that respond to industry and community demands.
Metrics:A. Percentage of degree programs with an embedded credential.B. Percentage of graduates who attain the credential.	 Metrics: A. Percentage of degree paths with an applied learning requirement. B. Percentage of students completing an applied learning experience by graduation. 	 Metrics: A. Number of new programs and certificates launched in critical occupation and community need areas. B. Demonstrate the alignment between new proposed offerings and jobs acquired by graduates and projected employment in the market area. C. Number of students enrolled in these programs.
 Strategic Initiatives/Projects 2.1.1 Identify and prioritize program level micro- credentials. 2.1.2 Identify and implement technology tools and platforms for offering and tracking digital badges and other micro credentials. 2.1.3 Develop training programs for faculty to embed micro-credentials in academic curriculum. 	 2.2.1 Launch and leverage the Gen Ed Connections program to build career readiness. 2.2.2 Launch training program for faculty to learn how to Integrate industry-specific content and support apprenticeship programs. 2.2.3 Design interventions that connect academic learning to solving local problems through community engaged scholarship and learning. 2.2.4 Develop co-curricular programming that supports students in applying the DEI learning outcomes in the general education curriculum to their role as engaged citizens. 	 2.3.1 Launch a new program review and improvement process that enables investments in new and existing programs with potential for growth and market differentiation. 2.3.2 Leverage industry advisory boards of SBDC and VMEC to vet new program ideas that mitigate gap in demand occupations. 2.3.3 Apply innovative delivery approaches to existing VTSU programs to expand accessibility and impact.

Strategic Priority #3:

Become a leading community-engaged univ	ersity that serves as a catalyst for rural advancem	nent.
Objective 3.1 Connect faculty, staff, and students with community leaders to co-envision solutions to local and global problems of rural areas and foster community-engaged scholarship and learning.	Objective 3.2 Build mutually beneficial collaborations with key community partners such as K-12, business, industry, non-profit, government, and other organizations in rural areas.	Objective 3.3 Ignite innovation and entrepreneurship and build new start-ups for rural advancement.
 Metrics: A. Number of ongoing or completed community engagement initiatives. B. Percentage of community engagement initiatives that involve student or faculty research, scholarship, or learning. 	Metrics:A. Number of official partnerships with community partners.B. Financial impact to partners and university.	 Metrics: A. Number of startups launched or supported. B. Financial impact to startups, communities, and university.
 Strategic Initiatives/Projects 3.1.1 Develop a strategy to identify and address community and rural advancement needs and design a dashboard that highlights success stories. 3.1.2 Implement processes and training programs for faculty to understand how to embed service-learning projects into academic curriculum. 3.1.3 Build a continuous improvement procedure to ensure that our workforce, community, and economic development efforts are reaching the most vulnerable Vermonters. 	 3.2.1 Seek out and cultivate partnerships that will support and sustain a diversified VTSU community (i.e., Vermont Professionals of Color Network). 3.2.2 Expand dual enrollment and early college initiatives to ensure VTSU is a major partner with Vermont high schools and technical centers. 3.2.3 Pilot cost sharing structures to ensure critical access to specific degree programs that serve the public good. 	 3.3.1 The workforce development unit will identify opportunities that can leverage services of these units and connect them to student-centered activities. 3.3.2 Create a business innovation hub that serves the community, business, and students to ignite rural advancement. 3.3.3 Create campus-based coworking spaces for community organizations to have easy access to campus resources and students.

Strategic Priority #4:		
Become an employee centric institution wit	h a culture that positively impacts students.	
Objective 4.1 Foster employee wellbeing, including a strong commitment to diversity, equity, inclusion, and social justice.	Objective 4.2 Increase personal and professional development opportunities to enable innovation, creativity, leadership, and teamwork.	Objective 4.3 Adopt a culture of data-driven decision making, continuous improvement, and agile development with institutional sustainability and positive student outcomes at its core.
Metrics: A. Campus climate survey results. B. Measures of faculty and staff diversity.	 Metrics: A. Number of relevant training and development opportunities offered. B. Percentage of employees engaging in development opportunities offered. C. Level of satisfaction and extent of applicability to work responsibilities. 	 Metrics: A. Campus climate survey results (include culture questions). B. Percentage of university initiatives, projects, and pilots (of x \$ value) with project charters and clear objectives and quantifiable targets. C. Voluntary employee turnover data.
Strategic Initiatives/Projects		
 4.1.1 Create an online HR landing page to provide easy access to materials, forms, and information. 4.1.2 Develop new employee onboarding materials to include content on our commitment to diversity, equity, and inclusion. 4.1.3 Revise and streamline our current hiring practices to be in line with national best practices for inclusive job searches. 4.1.4 Build mechanisms to recruit and retain diverse students, faculty, and staff. 4.1.5 Standardize pay practices for consistent application across groups. 4.1.6 Include partnerships with community 	 4.2.1 Hire Human Resource Managers, shift centralized work to shared services. 4.2.2 Develop and deliver leadership training on performance management. 4.2.3 Revise annual performance evaluation forms to facilitate productive conversations and goal setting. 4.2.4 Develop and deliver opportunities for faculty and staff to grow their personal and professional knowledge of diversity, equity, inclusion, and social justice. 4.2.5 Launch Equity Advocates program with three participants in Fall 2023 and three in Spring 2024. 4.2.6 Deploy HR Managers to organization for focus 	4.3.1 Develop and launch a dashboard for campus climate data.
 partners to realize this objective. 4.1.7 Consider initiatives to promote protecting time for focus and connection (i.e., university-wide meeting free day of the week, no-work weekends). 	on performance and talent management and remote management of teams.	

ITEM 3:

VSC Policy 108 Revisions



Title	TRANSFER OF CREDIT	Number 108	Page 1 of 2
			ate /23

<u>PURPOSE</u>

To facilitate students' continuation of their postsecondary education, the VSC has established this policy to clarify the nature of credits within the VSC and for the transfer of credit from colleges outside the VSC.

STATEMENT OF POLICY

Consistent with its single course database, the VSC will have a single official transcript format. Credits earned within the VSC are not considered transfer credits across VSC institutions. Application fees required by any VSC institution are waived for any student who has matriculated at one of the other VSC institutions, or who has successfully earned 12 or more credits within the VSC.

The VSC requires students seeking to transfer into a VSC institution the Community College of Vermont, Castleton State College, Johnson State College, Lyndon State College or Vermont Technical College to provide an official transcript from the college(s) previously attended. Each VSC institution includes its transfer policy in the college catalog and identifies student responsibilities related to transfer.

Normally, VSC institutions will grant credit for courses previously taken under the following conditions:

- 1. Course work is considered to be college-level; in general, courses designated as developmental, pre-college or remedial are not accepted for credit.
- 2. Course work is completed with the equivalent grade of C- or better.
- 3. In a sequence of inter-related courses, if the first course is passed with a grade below C-, but the second grade is C- or higher, both courses will be accepted. Colleges reserve the right to determine whether or not courses are sequential for the purpose of this condition.
- 4. For transfer students who hold a two-year degree, credits applied to that degree will be accepted as transfer credit.

- 5. Course work is completed at an institution accredited by a regional accreditation association; each VSC institution reserves the right to determine the transferability of credits earned at institutions that are not accredited by a regional association. or the U.S. Department of Education and the Council for Higher Education Accreditation.
- 6. The receiving institution determines the extent to which transferred credits fulfill specific major or program requirements.

In addition, VSC institutions grant credit for college-level learning acquired through experience and transcripted through the VSC's Assessment of Prior Learning program or acquired on the job and formally assessed through the VSC's ETES program.

Signed by:

Sophie Zdatny, Chancellor

Date	Version	Revision	Approved By
4/25/02	1.0	Adopted	VSCS Board of Trustees
6/4/09	2.0	Revised	VSCS Board of Trustees
6/12/23	3.0	Revised due to system transformation	VSCS Board of Trustees

ITEM 4:

VSC Policy 111 Revisions



Title	ACADEMIC DATA MANAGEMENT	Number 111	Page 1 of 10
			ate /23

<u>PURPOSE</u>

The Vermont State Colleges ("VSC") shall maintain a system of academic data management that allows comprehensive and timely access to data that inform college institution and system planning, management and decision-making. The purpose of this policy is to maintain the integrity and effectiveness of the VSC's academic data system.

STATEMENT OF POLICY

The VSC supports transparent, student-centered access to learning opportunities at all colleges institutions. To do so, the VSC shall maintain a single course database, student records system and official transcript. Credits earned within the VSC are not considered transfer credits. Requirements related to graduation, class-level, enrollment status, course repeat and transfer shall be standardized. The VSC shall have a common grade scheme and common standards for academic and graduation honors. The VSC shall have standard definitions related to academic standing, probation and dismissal.

To implement this policy, VSC colleges institutions shall follow the procedures below. All college academic catalogs and other related documents must reflect this policy and the procedures below. These procedures are subject to change and shall be reviewed annually.

PROCEDURES

1. Maintenance of single course database

To maintain the single course database while allowing for the natural development and change of curriculum at each college institution over time, on an annual basis the VSC shall review those courses defined by colleges as equivalent for the purposes of transfer and when appropriate reassign a single course number, title, and single-sentence course description. Such system-level definitions shall not preclude individual college institution

elaboration of course descriptions and learning objectives in college academic catalogs, syllabi, and other related documents. Reassignment of course numbers and titles shall follow the following guiding principles:

VSC Course Naming Guiding Principles

- a. Courses may not share titles. Courses with repeated or similar titles create confusion for students as they move between institutions. A CCV student who takes a 200 level course at CCV called Criminology would be justifiably confused about why they need to take another course called Criminology at VTSU. Additionally, that student would then have two transcripted courses called Criminology. Finally, similarly named courses beg the question of whether the learning in the two courses is sufficiently different to warrant awarding credit twice to a student who takes both courses. Note: this principle applies even if the course is offered by a different department and/or has a different subject designator.
- b. For the same reasons that courses may not share titles, courses should generally not share similar titles. For example, the titles "Poetry" and "Poetry I" would likely not be adequately differentiated to avoid confusion on the part of students.
- c. Courses that offer sequenced learning in the same category (such as Anatomy & Physiology I and II) should be titled with sequential numbers starting at one.
- d. Courses that serve as the only offering in that category (such as Organic Chemistry) should be titled as "Introduction to X" or simply "X" as appropriate. Note: In cases where one institution teaches the second level and another institution does not, this may result in an institution offering Subject I without having a Subject II offering to follow.
- e. In the event that one institution proposes a course with a title that already exists in the system, the existing course will retain its title and number, and the institution proposing the new course must designate a different title.
- f. When there is a question about the course level (1000, 2000, 3000, etc.) that is not resolved by the VSC Course Numbering Guiding Principles articulated below, the level should be set at the 1000 or 2000 level. This allows the course to potentially be part of a Direct Admissions or other 60 plus 60 credit pathway for a student from CCV to VTSU. As CCV cannot teach courses above the 2000 level, any VTSU program that includes more than 60 credits at the 3000 level or above would not be a candidate for a 60 plus 60 credit pathway.
- g. In general, prerequisite courses should be at a lower level than the course requiring it as a prerequisite. This is particularly important with course sequences.

VSC Course Numbering Guiding Principles

Designating course levels (ie, 1000, 2000, etc.) is important in maintaining integrity of the curriculum and providing the most transparent student experience. VSCS registrars shall use the following primary considerations when determining a course number for a proposed new course:

1000-Level Courses

These are typically introductory courses having no university-level prerequisites, often presenting basic concepts and terminology. Students in such courses are expected to operate largely at the "knowledge" and "comprehension" levels, but should be provided opportunities to develop at the "application" and "analysis" levels.

2000-Level Courses

Such courses are at an intermediate level of difficulty, and sometimes survey a subfield within a discipline. They often have a prerequisite at the 100-level. Students taking such courses should solidify their abilities at the knowledge and comprehension levels, and be provided ample opportunity to develop their application and analysis skills, and/or demonstrate synthesis within a focused scope as appropriate for a culminating experience in an associate degree program.

3000-Level and 4000-Level Courses

Such courses are at an advanced-undergraduate level of difficulty, and are generally taken by majors, minors, and other students with a well-defined interest and demonstrated ability in a particular subject area. While continuing to develop proficiency at the lower cognitive levels, 3000-level courses are expected to provide students with the opportunity to operate at the "synthesis", "evaluation", and "creation" levels. Courses at the 4000-level operate mostly at the synthesis", "evaluation", and "creation" levels. They are often of a "seminar" nature, with the students taking significant responsibility for the course agenda. In particular, courses which provide students with the opportunity to perform directed research are usually at the 4000-level.

Supplemental Considerations for designating course levels shall include:

- i. Course levels an institution is authorized to teach (ie, CCV is not eligible to teach anything above a 2000-level course and therefore may not propose a 3000-level course)
- ii. Standards as determined by accreditors
- iii. Transparency to students
- iv. Ease of student pathway between VSCS institutions
- v. Standards and practices at other institutions
- vi. Class level alignment (ie, generally 1000-level courses are appropriate for first year students, 2000-level courses for sophomores, etc.)

2. Transcripts

Consistent with its single course database and its vision of student-friendly academic policies and procedures, for courses taken since and including summer 2002, the VSC shall have a single official transcript format with these characteristics:

- a. Credits earned within the VSC are not considered transfer credits.
- b. All VSC courses taken and grades received shall be listed.
- c. All VSC courses count in the determination of quality points and in the determination of cumulative Grade Point Average ("GPA").
- d. The transcript shall clearly identify the college institution where each course was taken, and the college institution from which the transcript was issued.
- e. Colleges Institutions shall maintain institutional amelioration policies, whereby students may request to remove certain grades from their GPA calculation. In all cases, grades cannot be ameliorated if they've already been included in calculations for awarding a degree. Grade history shall be removed from cumulative totals only; no courses or grades shall be deleted from the transcript.
- f. For students attempting to ameliorate grades at a different VSC college institution than the VSC college institution at which the grades were awarded:
 - amelioration requires one semester and at least 6 credits of satisfactory academic progress (2.0 GPA or better) following the semester for which amelioration is requested.
 - amelioration is allowed only once in a student's career.
 - approval must be granted by the academic dean chief academic officer at the home institution in consultation with the academic dean chief academic officer at the other institution.

3. Graduation requirements for undergraduate programs

- a. Each college institution shall determine which courses must be taken by its matriculated students to fulfill specific degree program requirements.
- b. For a bachelor's degree 30 credits, including substantial advanced work in the major or concentration must be taken at the institution conferring the degree. For an associate's degree, at least 15 credits must be taken at the institution conferring the degree; institutions may require more than 15 credits at their institution for an associate's degrees.
- c. Students must complete major program and earn a minimum 2.0 cumulative GPA.
- d. Students must complete all other graduation requirements, as detailed in college institution catalogs.

4. Class level

The class level of a student is determined system-wide for standard two and four-year programs as follows:

First Year:	0-29.9 credits
Sophomore:	30-59.9 (all students in all two-year programs remain at sophomore
	level after 60 credits)
Junior:	60-89.9
Senior:	90 and above

The class level of a student is determined in VTC's three-year program as follows:First Year:25.9 creditsSecond Year:26-51.9Third Year:52 and above

5. Course Repeat

Students may repeat a course once without permission. For repeated courses the initial grade remains on record and does not count towards GPA. Only the most recent grade and credits count for GPA.

6. Transfer Credits

- a. Courses taken outside of the VSC must have grades of C- or better to be accepted.
- b. In a sequence of inter-related courses, if the first course is passed with a grade below C-, but the second grade is C- or higher, both courses shall be accepted.
- c. For transfer students who hold a two-year degree, credits applied to that degree shall be accepted as transfer credit.

Note: See also VSC Policy 108: Transfer of Credit.

7. Full-time/Part-time and Overload Status

Full-time, part-time and overload status per semester are defined as follows:

Undergraduate	
Less than half-time:	0-5.9 credits
Half-time:	6-8.9 credits
3/4 time:	9-11.9 credits
Full-time:	12-18 credits
Overload for CCV , CU and NVU :	over 18 credits
Overload for VTSU:	over 19 credits

Graduate	
Half-time:	3-5.9 credits
Full-time:	6 or more credits

7. Grade scheme

The VSC shall have a common grade scheme and quality points at the undergraduate and graduate levels for all colleges institutions (see below).

8. Good standing

Defined as 2.0 GPA, except 1.75 GPA for students with fewer than 30 earned or GPA credits, whichever is higher.

9. **Probation**

- a. Probationary status takes effect when cumulative GPA falls below "good standing" level.
- b. A student already on probation whose cumulative GPA remains below "good standing" level is subject to dismissal.
- c. Students subject to academic dismissal or who leave an institution college while on probation shall remain on probation upon their return.

10. Dismissal

- a. The following requirements apply to students dismissed from one VSC institution with respect to enrollment at another VSC institution (all are subject to institutional exception/waiver):
 - generally, students dismissed from one VSC institution for academic reasons, if admitted, may take courses at another VSC institution.
 - students must reapply to colleges the VSC institution from which they've been dismissed if they wish to re-enroll.
 - colleges institutions shall maintain all other/ current processes related to dismissal.
- b. Students may be dismissed for disciplinary reasons.

11. Auditing

- a. The choice to audit a course must be made prior to the end of the Add/Drop period.
- b. An audited course does not count toward a student's credit load.

12. Academic honors

Honors apply to full-time, matriculated undergraduate students with no incomplete or failing grades. Criteria are:

a. GPA of 3.5-3.9: Dean's List

b. GPA of 4.0: President's List

Semester honors are based on 12 or more letter graded credits per semester, with the exception that full-time nursing students at VTC are eligible for semester honors. Honors shall not be awarded if an incomplete is outstanding when grades are formally reported for the term or if grades are changed.

Part-time students may be eligible to receive semester honors, in accordance with individual college institution policy.

13. Graduation honors

Effective for the graduating classes of spring 2006, criteria for graduation honors are:

- a. Of total credits required for graduation, at least 30 graded credits for a two-year degree and 60 graded credits for a four-year degree must be earned at the VSC.
- b. Graduation honors for two and four-year programs require final, cumulative GPA as follows:

Cum laude:	3.5-3.6
Magna cum laude:	3.7-3.8
Summa cum laude:	3.9-4.0

 c. Graduation honors for certificate programs require final, cumulative GPA as follows: Honors: 3.0-3.49

High Honors: 3.5 or above

Note: credits earned before 2002 are not used in this calculation.

d. Students in the final two years of a "2+2" degree program may petition to receive graduation honors provided they have earned a minimum of 30 graded credits at the VSC.

14. Transcript charge

B

B-

C+

The colleges Institutions may charge for transcripts and shall have uniform policies for transcript, grade, and diploma holds.

Point Value Credit Earned *P/NP* Equivalent Grade Y р A+ 4.00 4.00 Y Р Α Y A-3.70 Ρ Y Р B+3.30

3.00

2.70

2.30

15. VSC undergraduate grading scheme

Y

Y

Y

Р

Р

Р

С	2.00	Y	Р	
C-	1.70	Y	Р	
D+	1.30	Y	Р	
D	1.00	Y	Р	
D-	0.70	Y	Р	
F	0.00	Ν	NP	

16. VSC transcript notations for undergraduate student work receiving other than letter grades

Grade	Legend	Point Value	Credit Earned	
Р	Pass	0.00	Y	
NP	No Pass	0.00	Ν	
AU	Audit	0.00	Ν	
TR	Transfer Credit	0.00	Y	
CR	Credit Granted	0.00	Y	
	(non-course work)			
Ι	Incomplete	0.00	Ν	
NG	No grade has yet	0.00	Ν	
	been submitted			
W	Withdrawn	0.00	Ν	

17. Miscellaneous Undergraduate Grading Provisions

1. Comments on Midterm Grade Reports:

Instructors shall be able to add comments to grades at midterm that will be printed on the grade report. Comments must be selected from one or more "notes" that have been set up in the system such as "please see instructor", "student never attended", "student missed midterm exam", or "poor attendance". Additions to the notes may be made upon request by a college institution registrar, on an ongoing basis, provided that the notes apply to situations that are encountered by a significant number of instructors at various VSC colleges institutions as determined by the VSC registrars.

 <u>The Effects of Dropping or Withdrawing From a Course on Grading</u>: The standard VSC add/ drop period is 2 weeks for CU, NVU, and VTC; and 3 weeks for CCV</u>. If a student drops or withdraws from a course:

- during the Add/Drop period, the course is not listed on the student's transcript.; VTC may develop special "add" constraints to limit students' adding/ dropping courses beyond the first week.
- after the Add/Drop period and up until 60% of the course is completed, the course is listed with a grade of W (there is always an ability to award a W at any point in the semester).
- after the ninth week of classes, the student receives the earned grade determined at the end of the semester unless a special course withdrawal is granted with approval of the Academic Dean. A special course withdrawal from a course taken outside the home institution can be approved only by the Academic Dean of the institution offering the course, following consultation with the Academic Dean of the home institution.
- 3. <u>Incomplete Grades (I)</u>:

Grades of "Incomplete" automatically revert to an F at the end of the 7th week of the semester immediately following award of the I, unless otherwise determined by the instructor. Instructors have the option of assigning a default grade other than F. Courses carried through an I to the following semester do not count toward the student's credit load for tuition billing purposes or for additional credit toward graduation.

4. Credit Granted (CR) for Non-Course Work:

Students who are granted credit on the basis of College Level Examination Program ("CLEP") examinations, military credit, lifetime experience portfolios, AP courses or other similar circumstances (as determined by the institution where the student is matriculated) shall receive a CR in the grade field. CR distinguishes the credit from TR, which is used for credits that are transferred in from another college or university.

Students who demonstrate success in meeting the learning objectives of an existing course at an institution via a "Course Challenge" or "Challenge by Exam" (as determined by the institution where the student is matriculated) shall have the course recorded as institutional credit with a CR in the grade field.

5. <u>Not Graded (NG)</u>:

Where a student's grade is submitted after the deadline for grades, or where the instructor is permitting a student to continue the course into the next semester (such as with a thesis), a student shall receive an NG for the course until such time as the final grade is submitted.

Coursework carried into a second semester with a grade of NG does not count towards a student's credit load for tuition billing purposes or for additional credit toward graduation in the second semester.

Grade	Point Value	Credit Earned	P/NP Equivalent
Α	4.00	Y	Р
A-	3.70	Y	Р
B+	3.30	Y	Р
В	3.00	Y	Р
B-	2.70	Y	Р
C+	2.30	Y	NP
F	0.00	Ν	NP

18. VSC Graduate Grading Scheme

Signed by:

Sophie Zdatny, Chancellor

Date	Version	Revision	Approved By
10/29/02	1.0	Adopted	VSCS Board of Trustees
12/12/03	2.0	Revised	VSCS Board of Trustees
6/11/04	3.0	Revised	VSCS Board of Trustees
4/24/08	4.0	Revised	VSCS Board of Trustees
5/26/16	5.0	Revised	VSCS Board of Trustees
6/21/18	6.0	Revised	VSCS Board of Trustees
6/12/23	7.0	Revised due to system transformation	VSCS Board of Trustees

ITEM 5:

General Education Status Update Memo

TO: VSC Board of Trustees Education, Personnel and Student Life Committee (EPSL)

FROM: VSC Chief Academic Officers Group (Nolan Atkins, Deborah Stewart, Yasmine Ziesler)

DATE: May 16, 2023

RE: General Education Status Update

The purpose of this memo is to provide EPSL with a status update on progress to integrate graduation standards established by the Board within the new system-wide general education framework and related efforts to complete a general education program design for Vermont State University.

Background

In the early 2000's, in conjunction with establishing a common course database, transcript, and policies around general education transfer within the system, the board adopted four graduation standards as follows in <u>Policy 106</u>:

The VSC has established graduation standards in writing, quantitative reasoning, information literacy, and oral communication. The colleges will design and implement assessments for each of these areas according to a schedule determined by the Council of Presidents. Successfully fulfilling graduation standards at one VSC institution will be accepted as fulfillment of the standards at any other VSC institution for an equivalent associate or bachelor's degree. The VSC and the colleges will report regularly on student performance on the assessments.

In practice, what each of the institutions have implemented consistently over time are more appropriately characterized as graduation requirements that students may fulfil in different ways such as taking an exam or completing a course or series of courses with specific embedded requirements. Assessment of graduation standards for the purposes of improving student outcomes has occurred in more focused ways via the <u>Policy 101: Program Review and</u> <u>Continuous Improvement Process</u>.

In 2020-2021, a new VSC-wide general education framework was designed. At the May 2021 EPSL meeting, CAO Ziesler requested suspending the current approach to assessing VSC graduation standards in order to develop a plan for integration of these within the new framework.¹ During 2021-2022, a general education working group developed a proposal for a full general education program for Vermont State University inclusive of the system-wide framework. That proposal was subsequently refined and adopted in December 2022, with a phased implementation approach, by the four Faculty Assemblies forming Vermont State University. The following table provides an overview of each institution's requirements in

¹ See <u>EPSL meeting materials</u> for May 24, 2021 for complete details on the program.

conjunction with the system-wide framework of common general education category requirements.

CCV	VSC General Education	Vermont State University
<u></u>		
	<u>]Category Requirements</u>	
First Year Seminar		Connections I Seminar
	Written Expression	
	Digital and Computing Literacy	
	Mathematics	
	Natural Science	
	Social Science	
	Arts & Aesthetics	3 credits either category for
	Humanistic Perspectives	associate degrees, both
	·	categories at bachelor's level
Research & Writing		Connections II / Research &
Intensive		Writing Intensive
Oral Communication		
Seminar in		
Educational Inquiry		
		Connections III (bachelor's
		degree requirement)

Overview of General Education Requirements at CCV and Vermont State University

Integration of VSC Graduation Standards

Each of the seven general education categories in the VSC framework has been defined by learning outcomes to be addressed in ways appropriate to individual courses within the category. A preliminary review of the detailed learning outcomes defined for the VSC framework categories shows an integration of skills more broadly, inclusively, and consistently than the existing VSC graduation standards. For example, the <u>National Association of Colleges and</u> <u>Employers Career Readiness Competencies</u> includes these skills:

<u>Communication</u>: "Clearly and effectively exchange information, ideas, facts, and perspectives with persons inside and outside of an organization."

<u>Technology</u>: "Understand and leverage technologies ethically to enhance efficiencies, complete tasks, and accomplish goals."

<u>Equity & Inclusion</u>: "Demonstrate the awareness, attitude, knowledge, and skills required to equitably engage and include people from different local and global cultures. Engage in antiracist practices that actively challenge the systems, structures, and policies of racism." <u>Critical Thinking</u>: "Identify and respond to needs based upon an understanding of situational context and logical analysis of relevant information."

Preliminary Review of Skills and Competencies in VSC General Education Framework

VSCS Category	Skill or Competency	lo#	Learning Outcomes
Militan Europeanian	FOULTY & INCLUSION	1	Explain ways that language perpetuates systems of inequality and/or can be used as a tool for social transformation.
	EQUITY & INCLUSION	2	Unisionmation. Write papers that have clear theses (when appropriate), careful logic, proper use of evidence, and effective organization.
	CRITICAL THINKING	3	Recognize the use of evidence, analysis, and persuasive strategies including distinctions among opinions, facts and inferences.
	COMMUNICATION	4	Demonstrate in written work an awareness of the relationship among writer, subject, audience, and purpose.
	COMMUNICATION	5	Examine and write about the personal and cultural implications of written communications.
	COMMUNICATION	6	Enact the process of drafting, revision, and editing.
	INFO LITERACY	7	Demonstrate information literacy skills: create an effective research strategy, use information sources as par of the research process; utilize institutional resources, specifically academic library. collections; evaluate and contextualize the authority of information sources; attribute academically appropriate sources in written cour- work.
	INFO LITERACY	8	Identify and use key terminology related to research practices, including textual citations in appropriate forma and styles.
Digital and Computing	EQUITY & INCLUSION	1	Explain how digital media perpetuate systems of inequality and/or can be used as tools for social transformation.
-	INFO LITERACY	2	Search, evaluate, communicate and cite appropriate digital information in an effective and ethical manner.
	TECHNOLOGY	3	Determine when technology is useful and select the appropriate hardware and software to complete a variety of tasks.
	TECHNOLOGY	4	Use digital information and technology safely and ethically.
	COMMUNICATION	5	Create media that accurately convey information, thoughts and ideas.
Mathematics	EQUITY & INCLUSION	1 A	Use mathematical reasoning to analyze social justice problems in a variety of contexts and determine whethe approaches are just and equitable.
	EQUITY & INCLUSION	1B	Explain how knowledge created in the field of mathematics has contributed to and/or been used to dismantle social inequalities.
	QUANTITATIVE REASONING	2	Use mathematical reasoning to solve problems in a variety of contexts and determine whether their solutions are reasonable and sound.
	COMMUNICATION	3	Represent and communicate mathematical information symbolically, visually, and numerically.
	CRITICAL THINKING	4	Explain the logical reasoning behind their mathematical decisions.
	QUANTITATIVE REASONING	5	Articulate the importance and limitations of using quantitative data and/or statistical methods in decision making.
Natural Science	EQUITY & INCLUSION	1 A	Use scientific reasoning to analyze social justice problems in a variety of contexts and determine whether approaches are just and equitable.
	EQUITY & INCLUSION	1B	Explain how knowledge created in the natural sciences has contributed to and/or been used to create, maintain, or dismantle social inequalities.
	CRITICAL THINKING	2	Learn and apply the problem-solving methods of a scientific discipline.
	QUANTITATIVE REASONING	3	Gather and interpret data using established scientific techniques.
	QUANTITATIVE REASONING	4	Assess the accuracy and validity of scientific data and information sources. Contextualize the role of science in real-world applications.
	CRITICAL THINKING	3	Explain how knowledge created in the social sciences has contributed to and/or been used to create, maintain
iocial Science	EQUITY & INCLUSION	1 A	or dismantle social inequalities. Analyze social justice problems in a variety of contexts and determine whether approaches are just and
	EQUITY & INCLUSION	18	equitable. Use theories and conceptual frameworks of the social sciences to describe influences on individuals and
	CRITICAL THINKING	2	one means and concepted mane works of the social sciences to describe inficences of manufactures of manufactures and communities over time. Explore the relationship between the individual and society as it affects personal behavior, social development
	CRITICAL THINKING	3	Explore the relationship between the individual and society as it anects personal behavior, social development and the lives individuals live.
	EQUITY & INCLUSION		Recognize and explain the social institutions, structures, and processes of global cultures and diverse societies Actiguite the impact of holomicani and for acting priorities according to main contemporary investigations.
	CRITICAL THINKING	3	Articulate the impact of behavioral and/or social scientific research on major contemporary issues. Understand methods used to gather and analyze data and draw sound conclusions from social and/or
	CRITICAL THINKING	6	behavioral research in an ethical manner.
Arts and Aesthetics	EQUITY & INCLUSION	1	Explain the impact of global and/or cultural diversity on the development of a particular artistic form.
	CRITICAL THINKING	2	Demonstrate an understanding of the principles and elements used in the art form under study.
	CRITICAL THINKING	3	Demonstrate the ability to develop ideas and opinions about forms of human expression that are grounded in an understanding of and respect for the historical context of expressions and artifacts.
		4	Demonstrate the ability to create or reinterpret artistic works through the development of skills of performan
C	COMMUNICATION	5	or skills of analysis and criticism. Demonstrate an understanding of the contributions of the arts to social change, thought, and/or wellbeing,
Humanistic Perspectives	CRITICAL THINKING	1A	whether individual or collective. Explain how ideas and texts in the humanities have contributed to and/or been used to create, maintain, or
			dismantle systemic racial injustice.
	EQUITY & INCLUSION	18	Use humanistic and/or historical thinking to assess a social justice problem and suggest a just solution.
CRITICAL	CRITICAL THINKING	2	Analyze diverse primary texts, and/or forms of thinking from a variety of eras in order to explain changing perspectives on human expression and thinking.
	COMMUNICATION	3	Apply methodologies appropriate for the course's discipline in order to articulate meaning and interpretation content in a way that honors diverse ways of knowing.
	COMMUNICATION EQUITY & INCLUSION	4	Describe how moral and ethical issues and theories pertain to personal identity and society more broadly.

Recommendations

Based on the work accomplished to date, the VSC Chief Academic Officers' Group is now bringing these recommendations to EPSL:

- The VSC Graduation Standards defined in Board Policy 106--writing, quantitative reasoning, information literacy, and oral communication--represent thinking and needs from over twenty years ago and should be updated. The VSC CAOs recommend that they lead work over the coming 2023-2024 academic year to evaluate options and present new definitions of VSC Graduation Standards to the Board for adoption.
- 2. While this redefinition work is underway, the Chief Academic Officers' Group requests that the Board approve the option to suspend existing implementation of VSC Policy 106 graduation standards as standalone requirements for incoming students and where necessary, implement waiver procedures for continuing students in prior catalog years when, due to new general education program implementation, standalone requirements are no longer available.